

Submission of the Alternative Mid-Term Report on the Implementation of the United Nations Universal Periodic Review Recommendations to Rwanda.

Report on Rwanda's Compliance with its Human Rights Obligations on Women's Rights

Prepared and Submitted

By

The Coalition of Women Led Organizations in Rwanda



Contact Person: Ninette UMURERWA

National Executive Secretary Haguruka Tel: +250 788 300 834, Email: <u>executiveshaguruka@gmail.com</u>

December 2023

Introduction: (about the Coalition)

The Coalition of Women led organizations in Rwanda (hereinafter the Coalition) takes this opportunity to submit this mid-term report to the UPR Working Group of the Human Rights Council.

The coalition, established by Haguruka in April 2023, is dedicated to the comprehensive assessment of the government of Rwanda's implementation of Universal Periodic Review (UPR) recommendations, with a particular emphasis on women's rights. The coalition is comprised of 17 prominent women's rights organizations, including Haguruka, Rwanda Women Network, Réseau des Femmes Oeuvrant pour le Développement Rural, Empower Rwanda, Save Generations Organization, Paper Crown Rwanda, Duhozanye, AKWOS, Pro-Femmes Twese Hamwe, Family Magazine, Rwanda Girls Guides, Rwanda National Association of Deaf Women (RNADW), SEVOTA, Hope for Single Mothers with Disabilities, Réseau de Development des Femmes Pauvre, UNABU, and Girls Leaders Forum Rwanda.

This mid-term report is presented as a follow-up on the implementation of the recommendations accepted by the Government of Rwanda during the third UPR review in 2021 with reference number A/HRC/47/14 with special focus on women's rights. It states the progress, the main issues of concern, and identifies possible recommendations and best practices to accelerate the full realization of UPR recommendations in the next two years and before the 4th UPR review.

This summary information will also help the Government of Rwanda to take concrete steps to meet its obligations and commitments to advance the promotion and protection of human rights of women and girls by ensuring the integration of gender perspectives in the implementation of all UPR recommendations.

This mid-term report is summarized in the following areas: Gender Equality and Fight Against Discrimination, Fighting against Gender Based Violence, Participation of Women in Decision Making, Climate Change Action, Maternal Health, Sexual Reproductive Health, and Inclusive Education.

The drafting of this report was based on data collected from studies, national reports, national documents (e.g., laws, policies, strategic plans), and interviews with relevant stakeholders,

including public institutions, international and national non-governmental organizations, and United Nations agencies.

A. Gender Equality and Fight Against Discrimination (Recommendation N° 134.21, 134.22, 134.109, 134.110, 134.111, 134.112, 134.116, 134.117, 134.118, 134.120& 134.121).

1. The Coalition positively notes the adoption of 2021 revised National Gender Policy¹ of which its overall goal is to improve gender equality and equity in various sectors while increasing women's access to productive economic resources and opportunities and ensuring that women and men are free from any form of gender-based violence and discrimination.

2. The Coalition welcomes the adoption of the Law N° 027/2023 of 18/05/2023 amending the Law N° 66/2018 of 30/08/2018 Regulating Labour in Rwanda which protects an employment contract of a pregnant woman. It states under article 24 *bis*, that "an employer is prohibited from terminating the employment contract of a woman because of her pregnancy." Further, the coalition appreciates the introduction of flexible time by the Government of Rwanda under the Ministerial Order N° 01/MIFOTRA/23 of 13/06/2023 on working hours for public servants and employees in the private sector. Article 3 paragraph 2 provides for the hour between 8:00 am and 9:00 am being a flexible working hour, allowing women in the workforce to attend and cater to their domestic care responsibilities.

3. The coalition commends the Government of Rwanda for amending article 56 of the Law n° 66/2018 of 30/08/2018 regulating labour in Rwanda, of which paragraph 3 provides for additional leave for a female and male employee who have given birth, in the event of complications or the child born to them has complications related to delivery.

4. The coalition recommends the Government to carry out an assessment on the decline in land ownership by women to better ascertain reasons behind this decline. In terms of land rights and access to productive assets, women's land ownership currently stands at 19% of total parcels and 49% co-owned.² These land rights have enabled women for example, to access loans using land

¹ Ministry of Gender and Family Promotion *Revised National Gender Policy: Accelerating the Effectiveness of Gender Mainstreaming and Accountability for National Transformation* 2021.

² Rwanda Land Dashboard [Accessed 24th June 2023].

as a collateral. However, reports have indicated that there is a decline in terms of land ownership for women which has fallen from 24% of total parcels in 2017 to 19% of total parcels in 2023.

5. The Coalition positively acknowledges the adoption by the National Bank of Rwanda, the overall overseer of the monetary economy, for the Gender Mainstreaming Strategy that aims to promote a gender-inclusive financial system, increase knowledge and skills to mainstream and communicate gender in policies and programs, and improve partnership with stakeholders involved in gender related aspects. Despite this progress in the financial sector development and financial inclusion, persistent challenges in regard to women's financial inclusion still exist. These include limited access to credit (loan) due to lack of collateral, limited control over household assets (i.e., land), limited financial literacy, and over-representation (80%) of women in the informal financial sector.³

6. The Coalition positively notes initiatives and programs adopted by the Government of Rwanda to ensure more inclusive and equitable workplaces with a special focus on the private sector such as the launch of the first National Gender Equality Standards in Africa (RS 560:2023) by Rwanda Standards Board (RSB). The standards are benchmarks for quality and safety of products and services, and they contain requirements that are set to assist organizations to embed gender equality in their workplaces.⁴

7. The Coalition welcomes initiatives taken by the Government and its partners to ensure accountability to gender equality through the existing mechanisms in terms of promoting the community-based efforts to ensure the realization of the rights of women — specifically for awareness raising on gender equality at more decentralized levels. These include, for instance, Gender Accountability days conducted in several districts across the country, and including all districts of Eastern, Northern, and Western Provinces. The implemented activities in this regard include civil registration, dialogues with private sector partners on gender equality promotion, workshops with teen mothers, and dialogue with village leaders, all focused on promoting gender accountability, women's empowerment, and GBV eradication.

³ FinScope Survey (2020).

⁴ Rwanda Bureau of Standards *Rwanda leads the way in promoting gender equality with the launch of the first national gender equality standard in Africa*<<<u>https://www.rsb.gov.rw/updates/news-detail/rwanda-leads-the-way-in-promoting-gender-equality-with-the-launch-of-the-first-national-gender-equality-standard-in-africa>></u>

8. The Coalition further welcomes the adoption of the National Policy of Persons with Disability in May 2021, which aims at ensuring that persons with disabilities enjoy full inclusion in society and equal participation in Rwanda's transformation agenda. The policy also mandates the Ministry of Gender and Family Promotion to, *inter alia*, promote the inclusion of gender-related policies for Persons with Disabilities prioritizing pregnant women/girls with disabilities.⁵ However, such gender related policies are yet to be adopted.

A. Fighting against Gender Based Violence (Recommendation n°. 134.121, 134.122, 134.123, 134.124, 134.125, 134.126, 134.127, 134.128, 134.129, 134.130, 134.131, 134.132, 134.133, 134.134, 134.135, 134.136, 134.137, 134.138, 134.139, 134.140 & 134.144).

9. The Coalition acknowledges Rwanda's commitment to provide comprehensive support to victims of GBV and child abuse. In this respect, the *Isange* One Stop Centre (IOSC) model has played an important role in addressing GBV by providing holistic service delivery to victims. The existence of 48 IOSC in district hospitals across the country, coupled with community awareness on GBV, have continuously increased access to services and increased the reporting of GBV cases by both men and women. Statistics form the Ministry of Gender and Family Promotion revealed that from July 2022 to February 2023 a total number of 18,284 GBV victims reached out to IOSC and received integrated services including medical care, psychosocial support, legal services, relief and re-integration.⁶ The Coalition further commends the Government of Rwanda for training 30 investigators in 2022 on sign language as this will enable women and girls with hearing impairments to report to stations of the Rwanda Investigation Bureau (RIB).

10. The Coalition positively notes the establishment of the Sex Offenders Registry in November 2021 which contains names of people who were convicted of sex offences,⁷ as well as the development of the National Child Protection Case Management Framework in 2022 that aims to

 $\frac{https://www.migeprof.gov.rw/index.php?eID=dumpFile&t=f&f=69753&token=137fb738c729ccbbc51dcfa6da9f52}{841d66b349}$. accessed on 29 June 2023

 ⁵ Ministry of Local Government National Policy of Persons with Disabilities and four years strategic plan (2021-2024): May 2021
⁶ MIGEPROF Quarterly Newsletter 03. Available at<

⁷ New Times "Prosecution publishes names of sex offenders". Available at

<<u>https://www.newtimes.co.rw/article/190194/News/prosecution-publishes-names-of-sex-offenders</u>>. Read also Rwanda Today "Sex offence registry: Youth, domestic workers top the list" Available at

<https://rwandatoday.africa/rwanda/news/sex-offence-registry-youth-domestic-workers-top-the-list-3589658>

strengthen provision of protection to all children including child victims of violence, abuse and exploitation.

11. The Coalition seeks to highlight that despite the progressive developments made in eradicating GBV, women and young girls continue to be affected with all forms of GBV, specifically high reports of sexual and physical violence cases. In 2019, 5,630 cases related to sexual violence were recorded for women and 153 cases for men. Further, 3,508 cases of physical violence against women were recorded in the same period.⁸ Other challenges related to GBV include teenage pregnancy, negative social norms and the culture of silence on GBV issues. These challenges further hinder reporting of cases and creates barriers to effective legal assistance to victims of GBV. It is clear that GBV has multidimensional consequences related to economic, social, health and legal perspectives. Further, the immediate health consequences include sexual transmissible diseases and increased unwanted pregnancies — including teenage pregnancies among Rwandan girls.

12. Furthermore limited access to GBV related services remains a concern. This is especially true in rural areas as IOSC are only found in district hospitals. Often, the victim must travel long distances, and evidence collection and preservation becomes challenging. In addition, interviews with key informants in the process of developing this report revealed that there is limited re-integration of GBV victims back into the community due to limited budget given to IOSCs and local governments. Additionally, reparations remain one of the key challenges for GBV victims as the majority cannot afford legal fees to file a case before the courts to seek reparations.⁹

13. Finally, the Coalition also observes challenges faced by persons with disabilities related to access to justice. There is a lack of professional staff to interpret sign language at IOSCs, and importantly, many judges, prosecutors and lawyers are yet to be trained on sign language.

⁹ Gender Monitoring Office Annual Report 2021-2022. Retrieved from <<

⁸ Demographic and Health Survey (NISR, 2021)

https://www.gmo.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/reports/gmo-anual-report-2021-2022.pdf>>>. Accessed on 28 June 2023

B. Participation of Women in Decision Making (Recommendation 134.13)

14. The Coalition positively notes that the Revised National Gender Policy of 2021 has identified, among its priorities, the increase of women's meaningful participation and representation in leadership and decision-making positions in public and private sectors as well as Civil Society Organizations at all levels. This continued progress towards increased participation of women in decision making positions is visible in the public sphere where, for instance, women stand at 61% in the Chamber of Deputies.

15. The Coalition is concerned with the lack of measurable indicators in the implementation plan of the Revised National Gender Policy. The action plan suggests it will ensure the voice of women and girls is heard and their participation in the national development process will be effective, but measurable metrics are suggested to better implement the action plan.

16. Lastly, the Coalition is concerned with the low representation of women in the media. Women represent 23%¹⁰ of media personnel and 12%¹¹ at the leadership level in private sector elected committees. This is below the required minimum quota of 30% set by the Constitution. The low representation of women in the media industry has been attributed to different factors, but the gender pay gap, and more worryingly, sexual harassment discourage women to join the media industry,¹² or push them to leave this profession.¹³

C. Climate Change Action (Recommendation nº. 134.25)

17. In relation to climate and environmental justice, the Government of Rwanda has put in place measures and strategies for environmental protection to reduce impacts of climate change. In this regard, the government has adopted a national strategic plan on environment which states that gender inclusion will be enhanced in the ecosystem restoration activities and also proposes the

¹⁰RGB, Rwanda Media Barometer, 2021

¹¹ National Electoral Commission, Rwanda 2022

¹² Fojo Media Institute *Barriers to women journalists in Rwanda*. Available at << <u>https://fojo.se/en/wp-content/uploads/sites/2/2022/05/Barriers-to-Women-Journalists-in-Rwanda-FoJo_AWiM_2021.pdf</u>>>. Accessed on 19 October 2023

¹³ Fojo Media Institute *Barriers to women journalists in Rwanda*. Available at << <u>https://fojo.se/en/wp-</u> <u>content/uploads/sites/2/2022/05/Barriers-to-Women-Journalists-in-Rwanda-FoJo_AWiM_2021.pdf</u>>>. Accessed on 19 October 2023

training of private sectors, community-based organizations, and non-governmental organizations on gender equality, environment, climate change engagement, and advocacy tools.¹⁴

18. Also, the revised strategy of green growth and climate resilience, adopted in June 2022, acknowledges the integration of gender in early warning systems. This is key as women play a pivotal role in emergency preparedness and response as well as in disaster risk reduction.¹⁵ Further, in 2022, the Rwanda Environmental Management Authority (REMA) awarded grants to projects run by women and girls' which were involved in the implementation of climate change mitigation and adaptation programs.¹⁶

19. Whilst the Government of Rwanda has made commendable progress to moderate and combat effects of climate change, it is important to identify climate change as a threat multiplier that can deepen existing gender inequalities. Thus, based on its severity, women and girls are notably the most vulnerable to detrimental effects of climate change because they rely heavily on land and natural resources for household food and income generation. Findings from a 2021 study conducted by Kvinna till Kvinna Foundation on Gender, Women's Rights, Environment, and Climate Change revealed that 91%¹⁷ of the respondents indicated that limited livelihoods opportunities make it harder for women to adapt to climate change.

D. Maternal health (Recommendation no. 134.89, 134.91 & 134.93)

20. In its last review, the Government of Rwanda received three recommendations from member states concerning maternal health. In this regard, the Coalition takes note that the Government of Rwanda has continuously strived to ensure progress in decreasing maternal mortality rates, and maternal mortality rates have reduced from 210 per 100,000 live births in 2019 to 203 per 100,000 live births in 2023. Nevertheless, the government should take proactive strategies to reduce

¹⁴ Rwanda Environment Management Authority *Strategic Plan 2022-2026*. Available at

<<u>https://www.rema.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/REMA_Strategic_Plan_June_2022.pdf</u>> Accessed on 30 June 2023

¹⁵ Revised Green Growth and Climate Resilience: National Strategy for Climate Change and Low Carbon Development (June 2022). Available

at<<<u>https://www.rema.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Rwanda_Green_Growth_Climate_Resilience_Strategy_061</u> 02022.pdf>> Accessed on 30 June 2023

¹⁶ The beneficiaries are Farming Green, Dufatanye Organization and Sibo Engineering Company. Field data ¹⁷ Kvinna till Kvinna Foundation, Gender, Women's Rights, Environment and Climate Change in 2021, available at <u>https://kvinnatillkvinna.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/12/Womens-Rights-Gender-ECC-Kvinna-till-Kvinna-</u> <u>Rwanda-2021.pdf</u> Accessed on 12 August 2023.

maternal mortality ratio which is still high compared to the global goal of less than 70 per 100, 000 live births.¹⁸

21. Furthermore, 98% of women aged 15-49 who gave birth are reported to have received antenatal care (ANC) from a skilled health care provider during the pregnancy for their most recent birth, and 47% had at least four ante-natal visits. This is credited to a combination of factors, including community health workers who are based in communities up through the village levels and whose primary roles is to identify pregnant women and raise their awareness to seek antenatal care services at Health Posts which have been scaled up to 1,222 at cell level and nearest health centers. However, the recent survey indicates that rural women (47%) are less likely to have four or more ante-natal consultation visits compared to urban women (49%) which is a hindrance to the complete elimination of the maternal mortality rates.¹⁹ In this case, the government should embark on increasing awareness campaigns on the importance of ante-natal consultation visits on neonatal and maternal health.

22. Additionally, assistance during delivery from a skilled birth attendant (nurses, midwives, or doctor) is considered a key factor in reducing maternal and neonatal mortality. In Rwanda, 94% of deliveries are assisted by a skilled birth attendant with 93% of women giving birth in a health facility.²⁰ It should also be noted that as of 2022, the percentage of assisted delivery in health facilities is satisfactory to the extent of 98.95%.²¹

E. Sexual reproductive Health (Recommendation nº. 134.90 & 134.92)

23. The Government of Rwanda was recommended to ensure access to sexual and reproductive health for women and girls, facilitate their access to comprehensive sexuality education, improve family planning access service delivery, and uptake by increasing the number of health facilities and skilled healthcare providers.

24. The Coalition notes progress in terms of the modern Contraceptive Prevalence Rate (CPR) among currently married women aged 15-49 from 53.2% in 2018 to 64% in 2023.²² The uptake

¹⁸ UN General Assembly, Res. 70/1, Transforming our world: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, SDG target, 3.1

¹⁹ Rwanda DHS 2019-20_Final Report

²⁰ ibid

²¹ Rwanda Governance Scorecard 9th Edition

²² Rwanda DHS 2019-20_Final Report

and usage by men, however, is still low due to discriminatory gendered social norms such as some men being opposed to the use of male methods of contraception, and some are opposed to any contraceptive use even by their partners.²³

25. Additionally, the Coalition notes that comprehensive sexuality education has been taught in the formal school through the competence-based education curriculum since 2015, but knowledge and skills for prevention of unintended and early pregnancies is not included in the current competence-based education curriculum. According to WHO, adolescent mothers (aged 10–19 years) face higher risks of eclampsia, puerperal endometritis, systemic infections, and dying during or after childbirth than women aged 20–24 years. Further, babies of adolescent mothers face higher risks of low birth weight, preterm birth, and severe neonatal condition.²⁴ Findings by the coalition also point out that early childbearing restrains adolescent girls from pursuing educational opportunities; thereby, limiting their employment opportunities and confining them to the cycle of poverty. Lastly, the Coalition is concerned with challenges faced by women and girls with hearing impairments as they do not have access to information on sexual and reproductive health.

F. Inclusive Education (Recommendation no. 134.99 & 134.100)

26. In terms of human capital development, the coalition commends the achieved gender parity in education as a result of inclusive education policies and programs especially in the primary and secondary levels. Also, the enrolment of women and girls in Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET), Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics (STEM), and Information Technology (IT) related trades has achieved a notable progress, thus increasing demand driven skills for women. The recent data for instance show that the representation of girls in STEM is at 47.7% compared to 52.3% of boys.

27. In addition, the Coalition positively notes the increase of dedicated girl's rooms in schools. As of the academic year 2021/2022, 62.7% of schools had such rooms compared to the year

 ²³ Schwandt et al. Reprod Health (2021) 18:82, available at <u>https://doi.org/10.1186/s12978-021-01135-6</u>
²⁴ Available at <u>https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/adolescent-</u>

pregnancy#:~:text=Adolescent%20mothers%20(aged%2010%E2%80%9319,birth%20and%20severe%20neonatal% 20condition.

2020/2021 where only 58% of schools had such rooms. Schools offering Secondary and TVET education are better equipped, with 81.5% and 80% of them having girls' rooms, respectively.²⁵

28. In terms of equal access to education and disability inclusion in education, progress is also noticeable through efforts to prioritize accessible infrastructure in school construction guidelines. As a result, the percentage of schools equipped with adapted facilities for learners with disabilities has increased from 41.1% in 2020/21 to 68.2% in 2021/22. Additionally, in the same period, 16,551 staff members have been trained in special needs education which has risen from 12,501 in the previous period. In the same academic year 2021/22, there was increase in school enrollment of students with disabilities from 30,803, to 38,8937, out of which 44.4% were female students. However, at the university level, it is noted that women's enrolment is at the lowest standing of 37.6% compared to men's at 62.4%. Therefore, the Government is recommended to scale-up awareness campaigns to increase enrolment of girls with disabilities at all levels of education.

29. Regardless of the improvement in the enrolment rate in basic education, women's enrolment trends go down with higher education (after secondary education). Taking the example of polytechnic institutes, men continued to be enrolled at a higher rate than women (74.4% against 25.6%).²⁶ Also, the data from the 5th Population Census revealed that men (81%) in Rwanda are more literate than women (76.7%).²⁷

G. Recommendations to the Government of Rwanda

In relation to the registered achievements, future priorities should aim at addressing some of the following challenges that are faced by women and girls in Rwanda:

I. The Government is recommended to strengthen measures with specific indicators to increase the representation of women in formal financial services.

²⁵ Ministry of Education 2021/22 Education Statistical Yearbook. Retrieved

from<<u>https://www.mineduc.gov.rw/index.php?eID=dumpFile&t=f&f=70540&token=39669c8607fe9bcc6b5d44f46</u> <u>ec879a4d4bc5634</u>> Accessed on 29 June 2023

²⁶ Ministry of Education 2021/22 Education Statistical Yearbook. Retrieved from<<u>https://www.mineduc.gov.rw/index.php?eID=dumpFile&t=f&f=70540&token=39669c8607fe9bcc6b5d44f46</u> <u>ec879a4d4bc5634</u>> Accessed on 29 June 2023

²⁷ National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda Fifth Rwanda Population and Housing Census, Thematic Report: Gender: July 2023

- II. The Government is recommended to increase efforts including, but not limited to, incentives, scholarships and mentorship programs with the intention of reaching gender parity in the field of Science, Technology, Engineering, and Mathematics and TVET.
- III. The Government is recommended to adopt proactive strategies including, but not limited to, awareness raising campaigns on ante-natal visits in rural areas to reduce maternal mortality ratio to, at minimum, meet to the global goal of less than 70 per 100, 000 live births.
- IV. The Government is recommended to expedite the adoption and subsequent implementation of gender-related policies for Persons with Disabilities prioritizing pregnant women/girls with disabilities as suggested in the National Policy on Disabilities.
- V. The Government is recommended to take measures to address the continued imbalance in the burdens of "unpaid care work" carried out by women as these measures would enable equitable division of time for women who predominantly work in subsistence agriculture and the informal sector.
- VI. The Government is recommended to take proactive measures to eradicate violence against women and girls as outlined in this report.
- VII. The Government is recommended to adopt and implement gender responsive strategies to increase the adaptation capacity of women to respond to potential shocks posed by climate change such as droughts and floods.
- VIII. The Government is recommended to take measures to increase women's representation in decentralized entities and the private sector. This includes addressing challenges such as the gender pay gap and harassment faced by women in joining and remaining in the media profession. This further includes increasing capacity building initiatives and providing incentives to employers.
- IX. The Government is recommended to review the implementation plan of the Revised National Gender Policy and include measurable indicators to ensure the voice of women and girls is heard, and their participation in the national development process is effective.

- X. The Government is recommended to accelerate initiatives to increase literacy among women to improve their ability to participate in the social, economic, and political spheres.
- XI. The Government is recommended to carry out an assessment to ascertain causes in the decline of land ownership by women.
- XII. The Government is recommended to develop a capacity building strategy to train more investigators, officials at *Isange* One Stop Centres, prosecutors, judges, and lawyers on sign language.
- XIII. The Government is recommended to increase IOSCs and Local government budgets with the goal of better re-integrating GBV victims back into the community.
- XIV. The Government is recommended to scale-up awareness campaigns to increase enrolment of girls with disabilities at all levels of education.
- XV. The Government is recommended to develop and implement a communication strategy on sexual and reproductive health to ensure that women and girls with hearing impairment have access to information on sexual and reproductive health rights.
- XVI. The Government is recommended to speed-up the revision of the Law governing persons and Family in order to the address the identified gaps related to promoting an inclusive and gender friendly legal framework.